Research Article

Revisiting Cultured and Uncultured: The Context of Climate Change in Contemporary India

Jullie Rani

Independent Researcher, PhD Awarded at Centre for Political Studies, School of Social Sciences

Jawaharlal Nehru University, New Delhi - 110067, India

Email: jullie.jnu@gmail.com

ORCID: https://orcid.org/0000-0002-7934-9082

ARTICLE INFO	ABSTRACT
	This paper seeks to revisit notions of cultured/uncultured contextualizing them within climate change in contemporary India. The paper will pursue a case study of Swachh Bharat Mission to define various dimensions of policies, laws, rights, citizenship, urban and rural inhabitants and more to elaborate upon a larger idea of construction and destruction of climate in India. It has commonly been observed that often individuals throwing garbage on road, accessing river water to wash clothes (making it dirty) and more are labeled as uncultured and often easily accused for destructing the climate. These are the normative uncultured individuals. Digging deeper into this, it can be argued that these uncultured do not have access to better facilities. The sad fact is that labeling of uncultured often points towards larger notions of caste, class, gender and beyond. The normative cultured individuals visit malls, theatres, throw garbage in the dustbin and not on roads, use cars, have air conditioners at home, better access to food and other domains of livelihood. This paper moves towards a major and urgent argument that besides a discussion on caste, class and gender, the notion of 'beyond' is also in existence where normative uncultured and normative cultured individuals and notions intersect and overlap with each other. These intersections and overlapping are often ignored due to caste and class factors and more. For example, the resident areas of lower caste individuals are often labeled as dirty or unclean. Discussing class often brings the notion of power and seems to turn uncultured into cultured, uneducated into educated. The notion of 'beyond' also brings up the factor of education and educated/ uneducated individuals, wherein education is not merely literacy but an overall development of an individual. However, educated is loosely related with literate and uneducated with illiterate, defying the original context of the terms in normative conversations between individuals. In this context, this paper seeks to explore few central questions – How do caste and class factors affect climate change? Does cultured/uncultured function independent of each other, or are gendered, through which women/men of various societies are discriminated, in specific women here? Does the burden of defining cultured/uncultured impose upon women in particular? Does the category of cultured and uncultured here, label some as positive and others as negative, irrespective of their actions/positions in society? Have certain bodies been categorized and objectified as 'uncultured' always for reasons beyond socio-political norms? Do they point towards a larger problem of social inclusion and exclusion which is not just physical but also psychological and beyond? How has governance and policy making in India dealt with climate change which is also contextual within the notions of caste, class, gender and beyond?

Keywords: Cultured; Uncultured; Climate Change; Class; Caste; Gender |

INTRODUCTION

This paper seeks to contextualize climate change in India with the notions of gender, caste, class and beyond. The paper metaphorically uses the terms cultured and uncultured to present prejudices inherent in India's

Research Article

socio-political context. A connection will be drawn out between the politics of sanitation and climate change in India to elaborate upon the definition of commonly used terms cultured and uncultured, for a group or an individual. In the context of Swachh Bharat Mission in India amongst normative cultured individuals come Toilet Users, a fresh definition of whom this paper seeks to analyze. Another category which seems to be emerging may be defined as the Toilet Cleaners who are majorly seen as normative uncultured individuals. Such discrimination in society is not just visible but also invisible, not just physical but also psychological in nature and beyond. This paper seeks to make an attempt to bring newer dimensions into the politics of climate change and sanitation in India. A number of scholarly works exist around issues of sanitation but what is missing is an elaboration upon Toilet Users (TUs) and Toilet Cleaners (TCs) and distinction of these terms which this paper makes a unique attempt to introduce.

The politics of caste has always been a dominant category in influencing elections in India. The marginalization aspects have always been discussed through speeches, slogans, pamphlets by various political parties and their concern towards the marginalized groups have always been in the forefront. The aspect which has been missed out are the explorations of various layers of marginalization which have been tightly wrapped under a conventional pattern that several groups are marginalized and their issues need to be addressed in the larger framework of good governance and social inclusion. This paper will move towards unwrapping of these layers which have been missed out in contemporary India.

The paper will firstly provide an overview of climate change in a global context serving as a background. In this context, the paper seeks to discuss secondly, a historical context of caste and cleaning in India and develop arguments around how castes have been associated with cleaning purposes such as that of toilets, sewages, main holes, removing dead animals and more. After an analysis of the interrelationship between caste and cleaning, the contemporary methods and initiatives of the governments in India in context of sanitation will be discussed as a third aspect of this paper. In an attempt to provide newer dimensions to caste practices in sanitation and dimensions of inclusion and exclusion in India, this paper will attempt to provide unique dimensions to the definitions of the terms TUs and TCs and explore factors beyond. At last, conclusions will be drawn in context of sanitation and climate change in India and future policy suggestions will be explored.

An Overview of Climate Change

Climate change is a complex and cluttered issue to explore. If we talk about the report of Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change (IPCC), we can find that it is majorly bureaucratic in nature. IPCC is known to be set up by the World Meteorological Organization and United Nations Environment Programme (UNEP). If a nut craft of this report is analyzed it may be seen that climate change is happening too fast. The major reasons are emissions of Green House gases and more and we can witness rising temperatures throughout. In this context, the Working Group 1 examines the science of climate change decoding its past, present and future effects. In a nutshell, it examines how and why there is climate change. In the contemporary period in India, it may be observed that there are extreme weather events, monsoons are threatened to a great extent, Himalayas are melting and oceans are endangered as an after effect of climate change. A question arises that if I switch off lights and fans before I go out, how much change it is going to make towards climate? The Working Group 2 is majorly concerned with how to adapt with climate change, given socio economic factors and how vulnerable nature may become with such changes. It also argues that there are not only negative changes with change in climate but it also has positive connotations. The Working Group 3 is involved with mitigating aspects of climate change. The procedures through which Green House gases may be regulated have been observed by the group and measures countering changes in climate. Contextually, the role of the Task Force on National Green House Gas Inventories (TFI) may be seen. It has strived to develop a refine and internationally recognized methodology and software to calculate and send reports in combating Green House gas emissions. Water vapor is an example of Green House gas as it is able to control temperature to a moderate level. Carbon dioxide, Chloro fluro carbons and methane are known to be gas emissions resulting from human/ industrial activities. These emissions are majorly a result of human comfort, transportation and more. It may be observed that activities of every human have increased and their quality of life has improved since the year of 1750 (industrial revolution) and it may be seen as a turning point in this context. As a result, carbon dioxide, methane, nitrous oxide and

also ozone are produced. Until 1750, climate change was minimal. As the engines came and use of fuels was in existence, internal and external combustion were witnessed. Humans by then learnt to use energy for a comfortable life such as watching television, record interviews on camera and aspire for longer lives for themselves. This use of energy brought massive change in climate. In the IPCC report, it has been observed that around three million years ago in what is known as the Pliocene period carbon dioxide emission used to produce similar temperature like in the present context. This period is known for first human evolution and with time earth had become cooler and lives thrived but the present context narrates the same story. After the Industrial Revolution, anthropogenic changes started as a result of increased human activity which includes burning of coal, oil, gas and more. Energy became common for lots of activities and not only limited to cooking. Automobiles, fast mode of transport such as airplanes came and deforestation was taking place to build houses as the population increased globally. An interesting debate has been seen between developed countries and developing countries. The developed countries have often urged developing countries to cut down their energy emissions. However, the developing countries argue that the climate change is due to emissions of developed countries which have been living a very good quality of life for several years. So, the moral responsibility should not be put entirely on developing countries which have recently started living a good life through air conditioners, refrigerators and more. They are of the opinion that if they stop using energy for comfort, the developed countries should pay for their comfortable living in return. For example, very few Indians had refrigerators in the 70s but most of the Americans and Europeans did. The developed countries need to help developing countries to switch towards environment friendly coolants and propellants. As regards the increase in carbon dioxide, the developing countries are of the view that glaciers are melting not because of their recent usage of energy but due to developed countries' major use of energy in the past and the present. The crux of major climate negotiations is that the solution may be moving towards electric driven comfort and more but the bills need to be paid by rich countries.

A historical account of Caste and Cleaning in India

Indian society has always had deep rooted caste inequalities. The politics of caste has always been a dominant category in influencing elections in India. The marginalization aspects have always been discussed through speeches, slogans, pamphlets by various political parties and their concern towards the marginalized groups have always been in the forefront. The aspect which has been missed out are the explorations of various layers of marginalization which have been tightly wrapped under a conventional pattern that several groups are marginalized and their issues need to be addressed in the larger framework of good governance and social inclusion.[i] Caste system has existed for several years in India with a Varna system defining a hierarchical categorization and includes castes such as Brahmins, Kshatriya, Vaishyas and Shudras. At the lowest rank Shudras have been provided a space in the caste system, followed by Kshatriyas and Vaishyas and Brahmins enjoy caste supremacy. A sociological account has been provided ample number of times in various scholarly works. The aspect which this section will explore is how and why caste system exists, with a number of castes facing the backlashes of hierarchical social structures created in the past, associated with cleaning the dirt of society and facing exclusion of various dimensions. The identity of Toilet Cleaners erases and gets erased by climate change in India. Toilet cleaners are a major bearer in keeping the sanitation updated and playing a positive step towards climate change. However, their major role of cleaning erases their identity as an individual. They are identified as normative uncultured individuals who are destructing the climate by open defecation, throwing garbage on roads as a result of not having access to better facilities like the normative cultured individuals. A number of castes face the backlashes of hierarchical social structures created in the past associated with cleaning the dirt of society and facing exclusion of various dimensions.[ii]

In the pre-independent India, Mahatma Gandhi has been viewed as a torch bearer towards a clean India. But Gandhi never emphasized on cleanliness of some while others being dirty. He denies the idea of only a specific group of castes cleaning India but emphasized on being self- reliant. In this context, he argues that unless we "rid ourselves of our dirty habits and have improved latrines, swaraj (self- government) can have no value for us" (Gandhi, 1914, pp. 56-58). Gandhi was against the practice of untouchability in pre independent India and shunned the idea of associating some castes as untouchables and them being forced to work in filth and dirt and

Research Article

often reside in outside areas far from the mainland. Gandhi made removal of untouchability, part of his national movement in India. A lack of sanitation according to him is likely to disrupt not only economy but also social, political and cultural domains in India. He emphasized on the fact that everyone should be his own scavenger and this could be witnessed not only in his statement but he also practiced it, Gandhi talks about untouchables in context of according an equal social status to all. This paper similarly, attempts to bring out the day-to-day inequalities faced by the marginalized owing caste discriminatory practices existing in India since pre independent India and even earlier times (Collected Works of Gandhi). [iii]

DR B.R Ambedkar has talked about sanitation and scavengers arguing about the ascribed identity of a scavenger because of his birth in a family of a specific caste associated with cleaning. In his work titled What Congress and Gandhi Have Done to the Untouchables, he argues that "In India, a man is not a scavenger because of his work. He is a scavenger because of his birth irrespective of the question whether he does scavenge or not." (Ambedkar,1946, p.218). He questions Gandhi's views on scavenging as a noble profession. He criticizes him to the fact that a Brahmin scavenging after following Gandhi and a Dalit scavenging because of his birth, the pains of both can never be equated. According to Ambedkar, Gandhism has failed to understand the deep-rooted caste inequalities in India. Taking on to Gandhi and Ambedkar's views, this paper argues that the marginalization aspect cannot be reduced by making a Brahmin do the same work as he will remain a Brahmin and an upper caste individual while a Dalit will be a Dalit and exposed to discriminatory practices for life time. The aspect behind according an equal social status provided by Gandhi seems impossible without removal of caste system itself. For as long as caste system exists, a Dalit even if he/she holds a position of prime importance in the country will have a dominated social status, dominant status being the upper caste. This context of social status can be clearly seen in Waiting for a Visa by Ambedkar. While on his way to home, he had to get down from a bullock cart after the upper caste driver of the cart gained knowledge that he had a Dalit passenger. Ambedkar has argued that he being a barrister at law did not matter to the driver and his social status was decided by the driver in recognition to the caste in which Ambedkar was born. (Ambedkar, 1935). His ascribed identity overpowers his achieved identity and that of all Dalits in India. Caste menace will be largely removed when achieved identity (job or any other form of success) overpowers ascribed identity (belong to a caste because of being born in a family of that particular caste).

As India achieved its independence, it saw a number of initiatives taken by the government in context of caste. Though untouchability has been abolished under Article 17 of the Indian constitution which forbids any form of its practice and is punishable by law, the existing sad fact which remains is that cleaning has been still psychologically associated with specific castes. In the Indian Constitution, Article 14 and 15 deal with prohibition of discrimination. While Article 14 talks about equality of all before the law, Article 15 prohibits the state against any discriminatory practices towards an individual belonging to a particular caste, religion, race, sex and place of birth. Since independence, a number of commissions for scheduled castes have been set up by the government of India.[iv] It is not that the government of India has not strived to eradicate caste discriminatory practices. However, the deeply rooted social hierarchical structures moves beyond a 'visible' form of discrimination in many cases with discrimination being in 'invisible forms. For example, the cups being separated till date different for family members and different for their helpers is one form of 'invisible' discrimination. Similarly, the mindset that the household latrines and the sewages be cleaned by the cleaners of castes belonging to traditional occupation of castes and other menial jobs such as dead animal removing or that of dirt removing to be done by them seems to be maintained in an 'invisible' form of discrimination. To add to this, a 'visible' form of discrimination would be directly asking caste of an individual and then assigning him/her a particular job and will be a punishable offense if complaint is made, though many such cases and more go unreported. The families which are traditional scavengers have been identified by the upper castes through the area in which they reside together as communities. This identification is not only in rural areas but also emerging in urban setup. This exposes social exclusion towards them. Such practices eventually are leading India backwards and not forward. In the present times in India, there are many colonies which are specific caste clustered. The normative cultured individuals are often found covering their nose while passing through colonies, not sharing tea cups with them. The extent of social exclusion is such that a psychology seems to develop that these historical toilet cleaning castes have filth in their bodies itself. Many a times these normative

cultured individuals (socially included, with privileges such as belonging to a dominant caste) have blamed these normative uncultured individuals (socially excluded). Contextually, it may be argued here that social inclusion and exclusion is not just physical but also psychological which is not visible and further complicates caste dimensions in India. The aspect of casteless colonies also came as a concern for the Indian government.

Sanitation in contemporary India

As the study of Public Policy took a rise in contemporary India, sanitation has been identified as one of the concerns in this domain. As Covid 19 strikes the world in 2020-21, an urgent need to bring sanitation with a goal of sustainable development has come up. Started on 2nd October, 2014 Swachh Bharat Mission (Clean India Mission) took all the limelight from the sanitation efforts of the past. Trying to follow the footsteps of Gandhi, it was introduced by the government of India on his 145th birth anniversary. In a historic move this was launched by the then and current Prime Minister of India, Mr. Narendra Modi. India has always faced the lack of good sanitation activities owing to poverty, unemployment and more. A question arises that if a family can barely have a meal a day, how can that family look for a toilet? The aspect of social exclusion makes the matters even worse for the castes associated with cleaning in India. The Swachh Bharat Abhiyaan reads out its pledge as –

"Mahatma Gandhi dreamt of an India which was not only free but also clean and developed....

I take this pledge that I will remain committed towards cleanliness ... I will neither litter not let others litter......

With this firm belief, I will propagate the message of Swachh Bharat Mission in villages and towns.

I will encourage 100 other persons to take this pledge which I am taking today.

I will endeavor to make them devote their 100 hours for cleanliness.

I am confident that every step I take towards cleanliness will help in making my country clean".[v]

We can see that cleanliness has been associated with sustainable development of India in the Swachh Bharat mission pledge. A broader perspective can be viewed that if there is sustainable development, it can be achieved through social inclusion and not exclusion. The task is difficult but not impossible of sensitizing people towards sanitation workers. Their importance needs to be attached with the sustainable development along with the white-collar jobs. 'Mother India' mentioned in the pledge is an abstract term implying India who is just like our mother caring and nurturing us and in turn needs to be cared and nurtured as well. This term strives to put an emotional responsibility on Indian citizens to treat India as their mother. A clean India would mean serving Mother India. Through this pledge a level of commitment has been asked from fellow citizens for keeping their surroundings neat and clean. This asks the Indian citizens to take out time from their busy schedule and devote sometime to cleanliness for keeping their country clean. As responsible citizens Indians have been provided with a platform to engage in a quest for this idea of cleanliness with their family, friends, staff and more and contribute positively towards climate change. This also empowers citizens to go to an additional level of responsibility and spread the message of cleanliness which Gandhi had imagined and which contemporary India imagines in villages and towns. It ensures a level of confidence in fellow citizens to devote hundred hours of cleaning.

The concern was also towards sanitation at the rural level as India has a number of villages. It has been strived to ensure the success of Swachh Bharat Mission Grameen (rural). As most of the villages do not have proper housing, with many villages still having mud houses, the establishment of toilets was a near impossible aspect and the state intervention was an urgent requirement to ensure proper sanitation leading to a large factor necessitating public healthcare in villages. With no toilets, defecation in the fields, roads and more has been identified as Open Defecation (ODF) by the government which has been rampant. The Grameen mission strived to make India ODF that is Open Defecation Free after five years that is by 2nd October, 2019 but that is yet to be achieved. The Grameen mission at its start aimed to achieve the target of hundred million toilets to be built. This paper argues that the public policy with a good management of solid and liquid waste management has been ensured but what remains behind is uprooting from the socio-cultural aspects which lead towards such

Research Article

practices of open defecation in the rural areas. The program has tried to be accessible to all villagers. However, as stated above there is a need for a sensitization towards sanitation amongst the public to ensure best possible outcomes of the programs. A clean India is definitely a move towards a developed India, as the mission aims but needs a broader perspective of an 'inclusive' India as an initial step towards it. It has clearly been mentioned in Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) that the entire world joins hands to achieve the status of safe water to drink and adequate sanitation of all to be achieved approximately by the year 2030. Swachh Bharat Mission is governed by the Ministry of Drinking Water and Sanitation (MDWS) which deals at the rural (Grameen) level. The report on Swachh Bharat Mission and environment was published in the year 2018, four years after the launch of Swachh Bharat Mission at the Grameen level. MDWS states that in April 2019, a majority of households (99%) have toilets at home except few. Moreover, the risk of contamination was less in water in ODF villages than in non ODF villages such as ground water, surface water, household storage water and water supply through pipes. A number of activities such as food preparation and storage were put at less risk with less open defecation in villages. This also resulted in lessening of water borne diseases such as diarrhea. The report indicated that ODF was not of much benefit to protection of surface water. So, adequate measures were needed to protect it from being contaminated from any source.[vi]

Along with Grameen level, urbanization in India and its major growth in population point towards sanitation in urban areas also as a major concern. Swachh Bharat Mission for urban areas has also been launched on 2nd October, 2014 like the rural level. Before its launch, The President of India (in his address to the Joint Session of Parliament) on 9th June 2014 argues that Indians must not tolerate the indignity of homes and there should be no littering of garbage. The right to life with human dignity is a fundamental right under the Article 21 of the Indian constitution. The question of indignity highlighted in this statement above comes somewhat near to the domain of exclusion of certain castes defined as TCs in this paper whose concerns need to be addressed for a larger framework of sustainable development. The development which needs to be strived at is sustainable development for all and not the questions emerging such as development for some while the 'others' are excluded, their exclusion maintained. That will certainly not be a sustainable development which the country aims. The questions of indignity and striving for dignity lead us towards the aspect of social inclusion. Similar to Swachh Bharat Grameen, urban mission strives to achieve hygiene and proper waste management following the lines of Gandhi. At the urban level, it works under the Ministry of Housing and Urban Affairs. The urban mission strives to eliminate open defecation in its totality. A very sad reality which has been witnessed by some sections of India is manual scavenging. The mission seeks to eradicate the existence of scavenging done manually. The mission has aimed at implementation of a range of modern and scientific municipal solid waste management. The mission is of the view that these changes cannot be brought unless there are changes in the patterns of behavior of citizens if they do not confirm to the directions of mission and negate by continuing to openly defecate or indulge in unhygienic activities. But to ensure that there is a need to firstly provide them basic facilities such as food, health and drinking water. This would be certainly an additional incentive for them to follow the guidelines of the mission. A healthy surrounding has been strived to be ensured by making individuals practice healthy sanitation. The interrelationship between sanitary practices and public health has been ensured by this mission. The construction of a range of toilets such as household, flush, public and community have been a part of this mission. A major concern has been that of solid waste management in India which this mission strives to solve. A strategy of Information Education Communication (IEC) has been adopted under this mission to provide accessibility of information at rural and urban levels to ensure proper sanitation practices by the public and emergence of behavioral changes in the public towards day-to-day sanitation practices. A number of capacity building programs have been addressed under this mission. The analysis of Swachh Bharat Mission has been used in this paper as a case study to provide an understanding of sanitation initiatives taken by the Indian government. However, it is not limited to this mission but has a range of other schemes to ensure healthy sanitation in India. In the backdrop of climate change, new initiatives may be seen such as the NSKFDC (National Safai Karam Charis Finance and Development Corporation) launching a Green Business scheme providing businesses for mitigation of pollutants and regulation of greenhouse gas emissions. TCs often get in contact with fatal gases while cleaning. To provide a solution, cleaning through machines has been ensured and manual cleaning prevented.[vii] The point which this paper seeks to ensure is that the aspect

Research Article

missing from the agenda of the interrelationship between climate change and sanitation is an issue of inclusive sustainable development. India's caste structures are deep rooted and it would certainly be an injustice that the caste factor has been ignored in the government schemes, not to mention the other social backwardness such as lack of employment and poverty in India and caste domination makes it worse. In this context, this paper has strived to make an analysis of TUs and TCs to provide a better picture towards what more could be included in the public policies of government ensuring an inclusive sustainable development.

Toilet Users and Toilet Cleaners

This paper attempts to introduce the terms TUs and TCs to narrow down the gaps between the two. The TUs are those who have majorly been included in the sustainable development with cleanliness agenda of India. The question which needs to be addressed is the sustainable development of TCs as well, who remain excluded. This difference between TUs and TCs is the gap of inclusion and exclusion in India. A sustainable development cannot be achieved with this gap existing in India. The inclusion of TCs in government programs through proper caste sensitization objectives may ensure their social inclusion. The vice versa situation seems nearly impossible because if inclusion would have to be done at 'social' level in the society, it would have already been done as India has crossed many years of independence. So, the possible solution comes from inclusion by the government of India (political and economic). As discussed already, TCs are the ones about whom Ambedkar has discussed in the past. The mere construction of toilets will never provide them with an equal social status and their traditional occupation will continue to haunt them. The social construct of caste is deep rooted and in the context of India, the divide between TUs and TCs is not only of class but also of caste. A UNDP report of 2012 identifies that manual scavengers (TCs of this paper) are not limited to problems of cleanliness or sanitation but go beyond and the problems of gender, caste and dignity comes up. The issues of caste and dignity need to be addressed within the framework of fundamental right to life with human dignity.[viii] A gendered analysis provided by the report of UNDP report 2012, lead us towards identification of an aspect of 'triple marginalization' amongst these cleaners. This paper seeks to argue that a triple marginalization of caste, class and gender has been faced by women TCs and it needs to be addressed in context of sanitation on an urgent basis. The aspect of social exclusion now joins hands with triple marginalization. The layers of caste, class and gender needs to be addressed one by one. Moreover, the aspect of caste makes the matters worse for doubly marginalized women TCs. The Prohibition of Employment as Manual Scavengers and their Rehabilitation Act, 2013 ensures proper rehabilitation of TC by local authorities such as municipal at the urban and panchayat at the rural level respectively.[ix] It strives to diminish the notion of manual scavengers in its totality. A statement has been provided by Bimal (name changed) in one of her interviews with Human Rights Watch. She says that whenever she goes for working at farms she is stopped from doing that as her occupation by caste is that of a manual scavenger. The families are threatened to be thrown out of the village and more.[x] This clearly portrays a picture of government initiatives not being implemented at all levels and the traditional caste occupations are forced upon the TCs. A threat of 'exclusion' remains and many a times TCs are forced to do the job of scavenging even if they are educated to a certain level and want to pursue something else as their career. These reports however, go unreported. So, the implementation of acts against scavenging needs to be addressed at much deeper platforms. The aspect of manual scavenging points us towards the fact that there is no safe exit from this profession which is an act of indignity of human beings. The Swachh Bharat Abhiyaan discussed in this paper has certainly created governance at a larger domain in the context of sanitation but the question remains that building of toilets and other sanitation programs does solve the problem of TUs but problems of TCs are deep rooted which remain unsolved. The government needs to ensure that there is a safe exit from the traditional occupation of manual scavenging for all who wants to study, work in fields or do any government jobs breaking the traditional caste hierarchy and trying to be 'included' in the mainstream. Another aspect brings us towards a lack of knowledge about ample number of laws amongst the TCs. The government needs to ensure that the TCs need to be provided the knowledge of existing laws against manual scavenging in India by the local authorities on a regular basis. The 'ignorance' factor is certainly going to give us a picture of a persistent manual scavenging in India. Ignorance and inclusion will never go together leading to exclusion and a hazy picture of sustainable development strived to achieve. A civil society named Navsarjan, established in Gujarat has set up Dalit Shakti Kendra (power to Dalits Centre) since 1995 to eradicate manual scavenging in India. It identifies

Research Article

that problems of TCs do not end with training facilities for other skills such as sewing, knitting and more but the larger question is to implement those skill that is acquire a job after learning certain skills. The efforts which some of the civil society organizations have taken for TCs is bound to make successful changes through constant efforts.[xi] A number of TUs have class barriers with the government making toilets for them and providing them healthy sanitation. TCs do not only have class barrier but caste barriers as well. TUs have been included in the sustainable development with cleanliness agenda of the government. TCs though have been tried to be included but remain excluded with deep rooted hierarchical structures of caste system in India. For TUs, target towards sanitation have been achieved at many possible levels. TCs however, do not know about sanitation initiatives due to a lack of knowledge leading to further exclusion. TU men have access to toilets so that they do not have to urinate in public. TC men struggle with protection of their women from caste structures, which force their women to get back to act of indignity of manual scavenging. TU women have been accessing female toilets made at public places in case of emergency such as that of menstruation or other needs which are women specific. A major number of TC women struggle with triple marginalization imposed on them of caste, class and gender.

CONCLUSION

Public Policy Suggestions

It is to be noted that cultured and uncultured are terms which are subjective in nature and are bound to change owing to factors such as social, economic, political and beyond. For example, what is cultured today may be uncultured tomorrow and what is cultured for someone may be uncultured for another. A dimension which needs to be explored are the reasons behind recognizing a particular group, community as cultured or uncultured and the efforts made by each to be recognized as cultured and not uncultured. The entire issue revolves around whether there exists such a thing as being cultured or uncultured or is it just a factor of domination and subjugation by categorizing certain groups as cultured and others uncultured. In the contemporary period, many studies on sanitation have been done under the framework of public policy emerging in India. The aspect which makes this work different is that this paper has tried to analyze the 'caste' dimensions which need to be included while making public policies in India. India is a developing country with many socio-cultural hierarchies embedded deep rooted. The caste system has always affected elections in India. It affects economic activities and is bound to affect sanitation policies made in India owing to a large number of TCs (discussed in the paper) belonging to a caste of manual scavenging in India. A historical context of caste and cleaning has been viewed in this paper to provide a better picture towards trajectories of caste system in India. The thoughts of Gandhi and Ambedkar have been analyzed in the paper to point out the fact that cleaning has always been a concern in the Indian context. While the recent Indian government initiatives have seen following of Gandhi such as Swachh Bharat Mission launched in 2014, Ambedkar's views have not been explored in those initiatives which provide another understanding of caste and cleaning in India. While Gandhi encourages all to clean themselves and their surroundings without external help to exit from unhealthy environment and clean environment leading to sustainable development of India, Ambedkar argues that there is no safe exit from manual scavenging. In India, an individual is a manual scavenger because of the caste in which he/she is born. The exclusion of scavengers exposes a form of racial discrimination and it goes against the rules of the International Convention on Elimination of Racial Discrimination (ICERD). The triple marginalization aspect explored in this paper through an analysis of women TCs points out that the initiatives taken in favor of women under the Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination Against Women (CEDAW) have been ignored to a great extent. The efforts to end scavenging have been through international conventions such as the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights (ICCPR), the International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights (ICESCR), and the Convention on the Rights of the Child (CRC). Along with these, India also engages with the Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights and the Committee on the Rights of the Child (CRC Committee) in an effort to eradicate scavenging in India. The many initiatives taken have been pointing out towards the fact that concerns of TUs have certainly been addressed but a major part of sustainable development has been missed out. In a recent move by the Indian government, TCs have been called Safai Mitra (friend who cleans) under Swachh Bharat Mission. Hazardous cleaning of septic tanks and sewages is one of the issues which this paper has tried to address. The unprotected

Research Article

cleaning forced by any individual has been implemented now as a punishable offense by the Indian government. The slogan provided by the government reads as Suraksha Nahi to Safai Nahi (if there is no protection, there will be no cleaning). The government strives to maintain dignity of sanitation workers, TCs in this paper. However, the dignity needs to be rooted from its deep-rooted indignity of caste structure which symbolizes manual scavenging in India. In an attempt to provide a platform for an 'inclusive' sustainable development, the paper highlights the differences between TUs and TCs. This paper strives to suggest public policies towards sanitation in India. The proposed policy is an 'inclusive sanitation in India'. This may be achieved through making a policy of caste sensitivity towards sanitation rather than just focusing on management and sustainable development of sanitation within public policy issues. The ignorance of 'caste' is bound to provide a failure towards development goal of achieving sustainable development with cleanliness. The inclusive sanitation will provide better livelihood for TCs in order to remove caste structures. The government needs to assure them that they join skill-based jobs through training and also ensure strictest punishment towards those who force manual scavenging. The government needs to engage into better machines for cleaning of septic tanks so that there is no question of cleaning by a human with protection or no protection. Better sanitation facilities will provide a good health care and lead towards sustainable development which the studies of public policy and sanitation in India have struggled to achieve. In the wake of Covid 19 in India, an 'inclusive sanitation in India', seems of an urgent attention for providing minimum government with maximum governance. The public policies directed towards sanitation need to erase aspects of all sorts of exclusion in the Covid 19 and Post Covid 19 period in India in an attempt to achieve the goal of sustainable development. This paper calls for further discussions and research in the domain of climate change and sanitation with inclusion of caste factor in India and address the questions of social inclusion and social exclusion.

NOTES

1. See Rajni Kothari, Caste in Indian Politics.
2. For a sociological understanding of caste system in India see M.N Srinivas, The Dominant Caste and Other Essays.
3. See Collected Works of Gandhi on Cleanliness-Sanitation at www.mkgandhi.org>cwmg.
4. See National Portal of India at www.india.gov.in, "Constitution of India", p.6.
5. See swachhbharat.mygov.in.
6. See swachhbharatmission.gov.in.
7. See swchhbharaturban.gov.in.
8. See, Social Inclusion of Manual Scavengers, UNDP, 2012 at www.undp.org.
9. See National Commission for Safai Karma Charis at http://ncsk.nic.in, p.2.
10. The interviews of Toilet Cleaners (TCs) analyzed in this paper have been taken from Cleaning Human Waste: Manual Scavenging, Caste and Discrimination in India, Human Rights Watch, 2014 at http://www.hrw.org.
11. See Navsarjan Trust-Human Rights organization at www.navsarjantrust.org.

REFERENCES

[1] For more information on Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change, see htp://www.ipcc.ch.
[2] Ambedkar, B.R (2020). Waiting for a Visa. New Delhi: Delhi Open Books.
[3] Ambedkar, B.R (1945). What Congress and Gandhi Have Done to the Untouchables. New Delhi: Gautam Book Centre.
[4] Kothari, R. (1970). Caste in Indian Politics. Hyderabad: Orient Longman Private Limited.
[5] Mathew Kurian, P. M. (2010). Peri-urban Water and Sanitation Services: Policy, Planning and Method. London: Springer.
[6] Sapru, R. (2004). Public Policy: Formulation. Implementation and Evaluation. New Delhi: Sterling Publishers Private Limited.
[7] Srinivas, M. (1994). The Dominant Caste and Other Essays. New Delhi: Oxford University Press.
[8] For more information on Indian Constitution and acts see National Portal of India, Constitution of India website at http://www.legislative.gov.in/constitution
[9] For all readings on Gandhi see The Collected Works of Mahatma Gandhi website at http://www.mkgandhi.org>cwmg
[10] More information on Swachh Bharat Mission rural can be found at website http://swachhbharatmission.gov.in
[11] For further information on Swachh Bharat Mission urban see website at http://sbmurban.org